



## The Formulation of Rented Flat Housing (*Rusun*) Policy on Medan Regional Planning - Indonesia

RAFLIS

Doctoral Student of Regional Planning  
North Sumatera University, Medan, Indonesia

SUWARDI LUBIS

Professor, North Sumatera University, Medan, Indonesia

RUJIMAN

Lecturer, North Sumatera University, Medan, Indonesia

DWIRA NIRFALINI AULIA

Lecturer, North Sumatera University, Medan, Indonesia

### **Abstract:**

*Housing and settlements are some of the human's necessities that have great influence in the shaping of nation's character. The residential development is one of the crucial factors in developing the regional strategy which in line with broad aspects in demography and strictly related to the economic and social life development for the goal of strengthening the national security.*

*Cities contribute an important role to the region in all aspects. It is stated in the Ministry of Public Works Regulation that city is the region in which its spatial planning is the priority since it plays a crucial role in economy, social, culture and/or environment. Therefore, a well planning which covers the three important aspects regarding a simultaneous development is indeed required.*

*One of the functions of spatial planning is to be used as the guideline for the regency in designing and executing the five year government program and annual program. The Indication of the development program is the description of the policy and the spatial planning development that has been set within the development program. The five-year program shall be identified within twenty years*

*to realise the Spatial Planning Detailed Design. The following programs are basically indicative in which are expected to be useful in organising the sectoral development program as well as regional development on prioritised regions within the first five-year or the second and so forth.*

**Key words:** Policy, Flat Housing (*rusun*), Regional Planning, Medan City

**JEL Classification:** H4, I3, R3.

## INTRODUCTION

Housing and settlements is one of the basic human needs that have a strategic role in improving the quality of human resources. In the Basic Law (Constitution) of 1945 article 28 letter H, stated that everyone has the right to stay and to get a good and healthy environment. Furthermore, in Law Number 39 Year 1999 on Human Rights in Article 40 states that every person has the right to reside and live viable. Furthermore, the Law No. 4 of 1992 on Housing and Settlement states that every citizen has the right to occupy and / or enjoy and / or have a decent house in a healthy environment, safe, harmonious and orderly.

Aspects of housing and settlement became a dominant thing in the development of the city for housing becomes one embryo in the development of a city. Aspects of housing and settlement can also provide a multiplier-effect for cities, ranging from improving the investment climate, increase in area of trade and services, employment, income generation other sectors related to housing (backward and forward linkage) to be able to give effect to the macroeconomic a country.

In 2005, Indonesia's population living in urban areas has reached 107 million or 48.1% of the entire population of

Indonesia. The growth of urban population will usually be followed by growth in occupancy, and if not organised and controlled by the local government, it will be crowded and rundown neighbourhoods. According to the report UN Habitat, the Habitat Day commemoration People's estimated that around 10 cities in Indonesia has a load area of slums, namely Jakarta, Medan, Semarang, Bandung, Batam, Palembang, Makassar, Banjarmasin, Surabaya and Yogyakarta.

According to Marja, 2008, the cost of construction of public housing as flat housing (*Rusun*), more than twice than building a regular house (private housing), is due to: first private sector can build housing for low-income people more effectively than the public sector. Both here more numerous supply used for homes with low quality, so that production for new residential housing is more expensive than the old. Still based Marja (2008), the production efficiency for public housing is 0.50, which means that the cost of production is double that of the market value. One alternative to public housing is a system of subsidies to encourage the private sector to build and manage housing, although subsidies for private housing is more efficient than public housing, they still can produce public housing with a market value of less than production costs they generate.

So that low-income people can get decent housing in terms of both the building and the environment and infrastructure, the government provides subsidised apartment development assistance. Physical development assistance in the form of modest apartment rental financed by the government through the budget and the state budget to the Ministry of Housing and other ministries.

Help housing finance, among others, the form of subsidies to help people in paying rent flats immediately cut the time of payment. Although the government has provided subsidies to low-income communities, but low-income people much delay payments due to economic problems the family, in

addition, because the price is cheap and the infrastructure, facilities and utilities are adequate, fishing party opportunists to return leased to other parties, so inaccuracies occur are the goals and objectives of flats itself, both for the occupants and the program launched by the government to address urban slums.

## LITERATURE REVIEW

One of the main role to reduce the high levels of inequality of income is a function of income distribution, the welfare state is generally comprised of income tax and transfer income (David, 2005), Recently, experts have acknowledged that the welfare state is not just a social insurance and income redistribution policies alone. (Mary, 2010).

When we see two main reasons for focusing on the ownership of housing and the welfare state in the gap. First, the house as a source of income security, especially to and transfer of assets for collateral and so forth. Second home ownership can act as a legitimate factor in generating agreement for greater income inequality, given the relationship between the ideology of the free market and the defence of individual rights.

Housing became one of the basic human needs and development become an integral part of the historical development of urban areas (Branch, 1996; Yudosodo, 1999; Santoso, 2002). The construction of housing in urban areas always face the problem of the tendency of increasing demand and lack of supply in the housing market (O'Sullivan, 2000). The price factor in the law of supply and demand is a balance point which indicates the level of a certain quantity (Hoag and Hoag, 1991). Is this balance that reflects the gap (backlog) housing, where housing demand can not be balanced by the provision of home. The imbalance in the housing market have led to a lot of people do not have proper shelter (Downs, 2004).

Policy of providing homes for people on low incomes (*Masyarakat Berpenghasilan Rendah/MBR*) held by the public sector (Yudosodo, 1991; O'Sullivan, 2000).

Besides the main problems in the construction of housing include affordability (housing expense to income ratio), adequacy (include quality and density), environmental conditions, and availability (Bratt, 1989). Affordability is a major problem on the demand side, while the availability of urban land increasingly scarce is a major problem on the supply side. Problems between affordability with a low impact on the quality of the land scarcity occupancy.

Quality of adequate shelter as a decent place to stay for family formation in accordance with the multi-faceted functions of the house (Santoso, 2002), it becomes very difficult for people in urban areas is owned today. So for people on low incomes (*MBR*) in urban areas requires considerable cost to obtain affordable housing and livable (Downs, 2004).

The role of government as a provider of public housing were deemed to be important, especially in fulfilling the needs of a decent and affordable home. Tutorial policy of providing homes to do with the MBR approach to the perception of the house (Santoso, 2002; Turner, 1971) in Panudju (1999). The proximity of the location of the house with work activities or that allows the creation of employment opportunities for MBR be an important criterion in the provision. According Bratt (1989) housing policy for urban MBR implemented through affordable rental housing (low-rent housing). Affordable rental housing in urban areas that face problems of land availability could be realised through vertical flats or residential.

Provision of housing is inelastic in the long term (O'Sullivan, 2000) because to provide homes (housing stock) are heavily once by many factors, among others: the price factor, variations substitution homes on the formal market, the availability of land and the ability building itself (Hoag and Hoag, 1991). Marja (2002) and RPJPN Housing Sector (2010-

2025) says there are four (4) factors that influence the supply side of the housing (1) provision of land, (2) the provision of infrastructure, (3) financing, and (4) institutional.

The housing market is an interaction between households looking for a dwelling with a supplier that offers a place to stay. The housing market is composed of sub-market which has segment substitutional groups or individuals (McClure, 2005). Displacement and changes in market segmentation is possible depending on the quality of housing. Changes based on rational economic decisions among household consumers and suppliers on the basis of price, income constraints (income gap), transaction costs, and many other causes. The operation of sub-market and housing needs done with location approach. Locations in housing construction is very important because it became a determinant of housing stock to serve the needs shelter. For example, two different sub-markets which can even be in a relatively small area, namely condominium with units of rental flats.

Ochieng (2007) states that the fulfillment of the housing needs of today is no longer the traditional approach to calculate how many houses will be provided in the housing market but by looking at the amount of household, government subsidies, poverty alleviation, and a better life for the individual and the larger community, so the quality will affect the quantity in the housing market. Housing development aimed at reducing poverty has also been started to be implemented in urban areas (Bappenas, 2009).

## **RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

### **a. Research Location**

Medan administrative city has the width of 26,510 hectare with 21 sub-districts which governing 151 political district which subdivided into 2000 (two thousand) neighbourhoods. *Medan Labuhan* sub-district has the largest area of 3,667 hectare (14%

of the total Medan area). *Medan Belawan* sub-district is the second largest area of about 2,625 hectare. While *Medan Sunggal* sub-district has the smallest area of 298 hectare (1% of the total width). Table 1. Below is the table of Medan Administrative Region.

**Table 1. Medan based on the sub-district**

| No. | Sub-district            | Area (hectare) | Percentage (%) |
|-----|-------------------------|----------------|----------------|
| 1   | <i>Medan Tuntungan</i>  | 2,068          | 7.80           |
| 2   | <i>Medan Johor</i>      | 1,458          | 5.50           |
| 3   | <i>Medan Amplas</i>     | 1,119          | 4.22           |
| 4   | <i>Medan Denai</i>      | 905            | 3.41           |
| 5   | <i>Medan Area</i>       | 552            | 2.08           |
| 6   | <i>Medan Kota</i>       | 527            | 1.99           |
| 7   | <i>Medan Maimun</i>     | 298            | 1.12           |
| 8   | <i>Medan Polonia</i>    | 901            | 3.40           |
| 9   | <i>Medan Baru</i>       | 584            | 2.20           |
| 10  | <i>Medan Selayang</i>   | 1,281          | 4.83           |
| 11  | <i>Medan Sunggal</i>    | 1,544          | 5.82           |
| 12  | <i>Medan Helvetia</i>   | 1,361          | 4.96           |
| 13  | <i>Medan Petisah</i>    | 682            | 2.57           |
| 14  | <i>Medan Barat</i>      | 533            | 2.01           |
| 15  | <i>Medan Timur</i>      | 776            | 2.93           |
| 16  | <i>Medan Perjuangan</i> | 409            | 1.54           |
| 17  | <i>Medan Tembung</i>    | 799            | 3.01           |
| 18  | <i>Medan Deli</i>       | 2,084          | 7.86           |
| 19  | <i>Medan Labuhan</i>    | 3,667          | 13.83          |
| 20  | <i>Medan Marelan</i>    | 2,382          | 8.99           |
| 21  | <i>Medan Belawan</i>    | 2,625          | 9.90           |
|     | Total                   | 26,510         | 100.00         |

Sources : *Medan City Statistic bureau*

Land function Map of Medan city shows that the land is functioned for 10 necessities, which are housing and other related activities, industries, services, companies, rice field, various farm, swamp forest, swamp, moor and vacant land. However, the data in 1998 of North Sumatera Province 2000 is gained only on settlements (12.510 hectare), rice field (5.433 hectare), and swamp/swamp forest 428 hectare).

**Table 2. The Monitoring of Land and Public Housing Development of Medan Public Housing Office**

| No    | Location     | Land up to the year 2002 (Hectare) | Realization of House Construction |      |      |      |      |      |      | Numbers (unit) |
|-------|--------------|------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|------|------|------|------|------|------|----------------|
|       |              |                                    | Until the year 2002               | 2003 | 2004 | 2005 | 2006 | 2007 | 2008 |                |
| 1     | Simalingkar  | 151.602                            | 8.178                             | -    | -    | -    | -    | -    | -    | 8.178          |
| 2     | Helvetia     | 97.100                             | 4.837                             | -    | -    | -    | -    | -    | -    | 4.837          |
| 3     | Denai        | 173.040                            | 10.228                            | -    | -    | -    | -    | -    | -    | 10.288         |
| 4     | Sukaramai    | 5.690                              | 506                               | -    | -    | -    | -    | -    | -    | 506            |
| 5     | Sukaramai    | -                                  | 114                               | -    | -    | -    | -    | -    | -    | 114            |
| 6     | Sunggal      | 15.500                             | 960                               | -    | -    | -    | -    | -    | -    | 960            |
| 7     | IKIP         | 2.400                              | 56                                | -    | -    | -    | -    | -    | -    | 56             |
| 8     | RS Haji      | 5.000                              | 225                               | -    | -    | -    | -    | -    | -    | 225            |
| 9     | Martubung I  | 111.435                            | 3.305                             | 99   | 34   | -    | 291  | -    | -    | 3.729          |
| 10    | Martubung II | 167.877                            | -                                 | -    | 437  | -    | 428  | -    | -    | 865            |
| 11    | Martubung II | -                                  | -                                 | -    | -    | -    | 192  | -    | -    | 192            |
| Total |              |                                    | 28.649                            | 99   | 471  | -    | 911  | -    | -    | 29.950         |

Source: Public Housing Office

### **b. Research Concept Approach**

The concept approach applied in this research is quantitative and qualitative approach, emphasizing on qualitative that in line with the aims and objectives of the study. The qualitative approach applied due to the problems discussed, in which the problems are not possible to be elaborated and analysed through statistical data, therefore, certain approach is required.

Qualitative research is an approach used to comprehend social attitude as the attempt of exploring intense information from a phenomenon or problems within the life span of an object that related to the problem solving, both from the theoretical or empirical perspective.

## FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

### *a. Land Utilisation on Housing at Extremely Dense Population*

The increased population in Medan City year by year has made the population ratio increase as well, since there is no changing in the largeness of the land itself. The population ratio in Medan City shows an increase from 7,858 people/km<sup>2</sup> in 2007 become 7,929 people/km<sup>2</sup> in 2008 and it increases again become 8,001 people/km<sup>2</sup> in 2009. Seeing from the population density ratio, the population density in Medan City considered high, therefore, it shall be one of the challenges in demography that need to be anticipated. Therefore, the tendency of the land getting narrow might cause the imbalance between the supporting and the capacity of the existed environment.

The residential location in Medan City covers the slum area, extreme, medium and low dense population area. The slum settlements generally located along the riverside and railway that centred downtown. The settlement within extreme density area (small size residence <100 m<sup>2</sup>, flat and flat housing) located in National Public Housing in *Helvetia* area in the West, *Denai* area in the East, *Simalingkar* area in the South, and *Martubung* area in the North, and flat housing in *Sukaramai* area. The population density in Medan City yearly is shown in Table 3. below:

**Table 3. The Population Density in Medan City within year 2008 until 2014**

| Year | Population (people) | Large (km <sup>2</sup> ) | Population Ratio (people/km <sup>2</sup> ) |
|------|---------------------|--------------------------|--|
| 2008 | 2,067,288           | 26,510                   | 77,981                                     |
| 2009 | 2,083,156           | 26,510                   | 78,580                                     |
| 2010 | 2,102,105           | 26,510                   | 79,294                                     |
| 2011 | 2,121,053           | 26,510                   | 80,009                                     |
| 2012 | 2,097,610           | 26,510                   | 79,125                                     |
| 2013 | 2,117,224           | 26,510                   | 79,865                                     |
| 2014 | 2,122,804           | 26,510                   | 80,075                                     |

*Source: North Sumatera Statistic Center*

The population in Medan City is not evenly distributed, it is concentrated downtown such as in *Medan Kota* sub-district, *Medan Perjuangan* sub-district, *Medan Maimun* sub-district, *Medan Area* sub-district, and *Medan Tembung* sub-district. Along with the physical development in the city nowadays, the development of the settlements moves to the South. This southern development needs to be constrained consider that the territory is the conservatory area. Therefore, In the future, the development of the settlements is expected to be focusing on the North, such as the *Medan Marelan* and *Medan Labuhan* sub-district.

The Selecting the research location is based on these criteria:

## 1. Population Density

The population density is the comparison between population and the large of the territory. The measurement is using km<sup>2</sup>. Population density is not similar for every region. There are several types of population density, arithmetic, agrarian, physiology, and economic population density. However, in studying the population density in Medan, arithmetic is used.

The arithmetic population density is the average population living in the area of 1 km<sup>2</sup>.

## **2. Morphology**

Urban morphology is the organic elements that create a city. Urban morphology created through long process, every morphological transformation of one territory contribute priceless meaning and benefit for urban development. Urban morphology covers:

- Detail Aspect (building, circulation system, open space and city infrastructure)
- Townscape aspect (spatial planning pattern, environmental composition shaped due to the shape of the surrounding environment)
- Regulation aspect (The total planning and urban planning that show the city dynamics)

The urban growth can be understood with the observation of morphological component by either applying the Conzenian or Typo morphology approaches. Functionally and economically, the territorial growth is influenced by land utilisation, building, plot and road access. Urban area occurs due to the activity system that thoroughly connected to the movement network. The interaction between these two systems, the activity and movement systems, gives the urban area the economic and property value of which its contribution is greatly influenced by the natural physical characteristic and the integration of both systems. Conzenian views that urban growth is geographically observable by cartography. With map, the potential distribution of natural and artificial are easily observed and analysed. Land utilisation, building solidity, size and land ownership as well as road access can be mapped and elaborate the relationship of one another logically.

### **b. Sub-district Development Planning**

#### **▪ *Medan Kota* Sub-district**

To optimise the public services in the city, *Medan Kota* sub-district needs to be divided into neighbourhood units in which each unit shall have its own service centre known as Environment centre. Each environment-unit shall be divided into several Purposed blocks that are meant for land utilisation blocks. The common territorial analysis theory such as scalogram and factor analysis is unable to be applied in analysing the service structure of *Medan Kota sub-district*. However, it uses the combination between index value of equipped city facilities and the number of population and notifying the condition of the field observation survey and land utilisation. The estimation conducted through four steps, they are:

- Recapitulating the number of population and the facilities in every political district;
- Making index value for each service variable;
- Summing the index of each variable in every political district then making the index of the amount in order to classify the role of each district in service system;
- Group the territorial service units in central system serving the central environment and its territory.

#### **▪ *Medan Helvetia* Sub-district**

To optimise the service and urban spatial utilisation, *Helvetia* is divided into several planning blocks served by city service centre with smaller service scale. The planning blocks for *Medan Helvetia* sub-district covers 4 (four) blocks, with the description below:

- North block: With the large of 275 hectare, is part of political district of central *Helvetia*, adjacent to – Kapten Muslim street area – Asrama street area,

- South block: The large is 299.97 hectare, is part of Sei Kambing street area, Rel Ketreta Api street area – Gatot Subroto street area.
- West block: Located on 400.00 hectare land, is part of Kapten Sumarsono street area – Klambir V street area
- East block: East block has the area of 182.25 hectare, is part of Danau Singkarak street area – Gaperta street area.

▪ ***Medan Tuntungan* sub-district**

Spatial structure construction is realised by organising the activities sites. It needs to be emphasised that the size of the space for the urban spatial structure based on the estimated necessity of the space itself, while the site and its intensity are based on the character of each conducted events or activities. The spatial structure concept chosen for the urban regional planning has the purpose of supporting the acceleration of the directional development of a city to its optimum level, it is also aimed to improve the environment quality and urban life of the city.

***c. The Indication of Program Implementation***

One of the functions of spatial planning is as the guide for the regional government in organising and implementing the five-year and yearly program. The program development indication is the elaboration of policy and spatial planning development stated in the development program. In this part, the five-yearly program will be identified within twenty years to realise the Spatial Detailed Planning. The next programs are basically still indicative which is expected to give indication for the organising of sector development program as well as the development on the territory which development is prioritised, either in the first five-year or the second five-year and continuous year.

The indication on the prioritised development sector is expected to be beneficial for the guide in organising the yearly programs that support the regional development and expected to give positive impact in accelerating the regional development thoroughly. In general, the spatial program is indicated to be implemented until the next five-year, related to the sector/sub-sector that happens to be the primary priority in the urban development.

#### ***d. Development policy***

##### ***1. Medan Kota sub-district***

The decision regarding spatial utilisation in *Medan Kota* sub-district is processed through the spatial conception as the basic or basic pattern of spatial utilisation to decide the spatial utilisation planning of the sub-district. This conception is the result of facts and analysis after the objective and purpose of the development found. Briefly, the basic consideration in organising the concept is as follows:

- The macro regional development policy is the provincial policy stated in the neighbourhood administration of North Sumatra province, Neighbourhood within metropolitan territories, and studies on Medan city development and the above policies.
- Micro policy is the Medan City government policy, covering the neighbourhoods in Medan City within the year of 2016, micro regulation government regulation, the long term and mid-term of Medan City development program and other spatial planning.
- The potencies and obstacles of Natural resources are:
  - Basic material of *Medan Kota* sub-district are topography, gradient, geology,

- hydrology, climate, type of land, land texture, and drainage;
- Land utilisation;
- Potency and obstacles in human resource;
  - Population growth tendency
  - Population distribution tendency
  - The community characteristic such as community structure, base don level of education, age, livelihood, gender, religion, institution and more.
- The economic activities of the community are; trading, industrial activities, agricultural activities, services, government, and finance.

## **2. *Medan Helvetia* sub-district**

The development pattern stated in the regional spatial planning (neighbourhood administration) of Medan city 2008 – 2028, Medan is divided into 9 (nine) city territories and 2 (two) primary centre, one of city territories is *Medan Helvetia sub-district*, that covers *Medan Helvetia* sub-district, *Medan Petisah* sub district and *Medan Sunggal* sub-district, in which *Medan Helvetia* sub-district functions as secondary centre. Therefore, to supports its internal role, *Medan Helvetia* sub-district requires good structure and infrastructure planning including; structures in trading, education, health and government and a lot more. Not only that, but it also requires construction management, they are: building density, the height, space, demarcation line, block management as well as architectural arrangement aspect.

Based on the above explanation, the things to be accommodated within the Spatial Detailed Planning of *Medan Helvetia* sub-district in the future are:

- Optimise the city facilities, such as education and services that effectively hold all activities in the sub-

district to support Medan as the Centre of National Events.

- Optimise the structure and infrastructure in the city such as; road access, education, health, public transportation service that effectively hold all activities exist in *Medan Helvetia* sub-district as the secondary centre.
- Revitalisation of *Kapten Muslim* street area, especially in reorganising the *Sei Sikambing* traditional market that can hold the informal sector that centred in that market, it goes the same with other traditional market within the *Medan Helvetia* sub-district.

### **3. *Medan Tuntungan* sub-district**

The settlement development strategy is conducted to ease the service of public facilities and the infrastructure, since the settlement distribution extensively spread and uneven, the public facilities and infrastructure services are difficult. Therefore, in this case, the settlement development strategy is directed to make sub-district and political sub-district. Political sub-district considered as the settlement group centre which separate itself from other community group of certain activities. Whereas, sub-district is the group of settlement which community are mostly focus on services and trading.

In the attempt of stimulating all aspects regarding the development of housing complex in *Medan Tuntungan* sub-district, the policy pattern of housing complex is all community aspects of *Medan Tuntungan* sub-district have the rights to build descent housing that covers all factors of health, convenience and pollution free, depends on the social economic capability of each; In the attempt to provide healthy and convenient housing environment, the providing of housing development space is expected not to mix with other functional activities. Free of pollution is easy for the advancement of

infrastructure and easy access to working places and service centres.

## **CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

Flats house as one of the government's policy to reduce the squalor and poverty of the city, can be successful if the building meets the requirements of minimum service standards, the establishment of public facilities, as well as social facilities and their maintenance for the building. The local government as a manager and fiscal constraints can not provide full subsidy to the residents of the apartment, so there should be contributions so that the occupants of the dwelling sustainable. Nevertheless, local governments must provide the appropriate service charge with the ability dwellers. Terms of appropriate housing for MBR committed to the provision of a simple flat faced with MBR behaviour and their perceptions of home as a place to organise his life. Quality residential preferably not too long as it can continue to live or daily activities. Management of the flat house need to consider the application of management rules more explicit so as to maintain the technical life of the building until the time limit. Management schemes by taking into account the results of the research can be used as a system to maintain occupancy will remain eligible for the MBR and maintain the principle of sustainability. Management flat house need to pay attention to the typology of each flat, especially on location, economic capacity, tenure / tenure and target groups.

## **REFERENCES**

BAPENAS, *Infrastruktur Indonesia: Sebelum, Selama, dan Pasca Krisis*. 2003. Kementerian Negara Perencanaan Pembangunan Nasional/Badan Perencanaan

- Pembangunan Nasional (BAPPENAS). Jakarta : BAPPENAS.
- Branch, Melville C. 1996. *Perencanaan Kota Komprehensif : Pengantar dan Penjelasan*. Cetakan Kedua. Yogyakarta. Gadjah Mada University Press.
- Bratt, Rachel G. 1989. *Rebuilding A Low-Income Housing Policy*. Philadelphia. Temple University Press.
- Christine M E Whitehead, *Financing Social Housing in Europe*, London School of Economics and Cambridge Centre for Housing and Planning Research, University of Cambridge.
- David Le Blanc, 2005, *Economic Evaluation of Housing Subsidy System, A Methodology with Application to Morocco, Transport and Urban Development Department*, World Bank.
- Downs, Anthony (ed). 2004. *Growth Management and Affordable Housing: Do They Conflict?*. Washington, D.C. Brookings Institution Press.
- Edward G. Goetz, *The Effects of Subsidies Housing on Communities*, Department of Planning and Public Affairs, Humphrey Institute of Public Affairs, University of Minnesota.
- Hoag, Arleen J., and John H. Hoag. 1991. *Introductory Economics*. Second Edition. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey, USA. Prentice Hall.
- Marja C. Hoek-Smit, 2002, *Implementing Indonesia's New Housing Policy: The Way Forward*, Kimpraswil, Goverment of Indonesia and The World Bank.
- Marja C. Hoek Smit, 2008, *Subsidising Housing Finance for the Poor*, Wharton School, University of Pennsylvania
- Mary Cunningham, Molly Scott, Chris Narducci, Sam Hall, Alexandra Stanczyk, Jennifer o'Neil, Martha Galvez, September 2010, *Improving Neighbourhood Location Outcomes in the Housing Choice Voucher Prgram : A*

- Scan of Mobility Assistance Programs, The Urban Institute*, [www.urban.org](http://www.urban.org),
- McClure, Kirk. 2005. "Deciphering the Need in Housing Markets : A Technique to Identify Appropriate Housing Policies at the Local Level". *Journal of Planning Education and Research*. Vol.24. pp. 361 – 378.
- Ochieng, Crispino C. 2007. "A Critical Review of Housing Delivery in Nairobi : Different Actors – Different Socio-Economic Groups". *Arcnet-IJAR (International journal of Architectural Research)*. Vol.1 – issue 3. pp. 140– 152.
- O'Sullivan, Arthur. 2000. *Urban Economics*. Fourth Edition. United States of America. McGraw-Hill.
- Panudju, Bambang. 1999. *Pengadaan Perumahan Kota Dengan Peran Serta Masyarakat Berpenghasilan Rendah*. Cetakan Pertama. Bandung. Alumni.
- Santoso, Jo, Budi P. Iskandar, dan Parwoto (ed). 2002. *Sistem Perumahan Sosial di Indonesia*. Cetakan Pertama. Jakarta. Pusat Studi Perkotaan Universitas Indonusa dan IAP.
- Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 4 Tahun 1992 Tentang Perumahan dan Permukiman*.
- Yudosodo, Siswono. 1991. *Rumah Untuk Seluruh Rakyat*. Jakarta. Yayasan Padamu Negeri.