
Performance observation of qualified teachers in the In-Service Teacher Qualification program

ARBERORE BICAJ, Ph.D. c.

European University of Tirana

Tirana, Albania

University of Prishtina 'Hasan Prishtina'

Prishtina, Kosovo

Abstract

Reform of the education system, among other things, includes improving teacher performance, and consequently raising the quality of teaching in the classroom. To achieve this aim, we need consistently qualified and professionally developed teachers.

In – Service Teacher Qualification program is one of the programs that offer such an opportunity, which differs from organized training programs for teachers in Kosovo. It leads to the establishment of the qualification, and improvement of quality of teaching through formal learning.

The aim of this paper is to measure performance indications of program attendees, through classroom observation, based on a document drafted by the National Council for Teacher Licensing and the Administrative Instruction (AI) of the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MEST) for the teacher performance evaluation. At the same time, the paper aims to identify differences in the performance of qualified teachers on the program, with those of 2 year higher pedagogical School qualified teachers.

Results of the study will be helpful, and will be used by policy makers to identify the advantages and disadvantages of professional development programs, through success of qualified teachers at work.

Key Words: Professional Development, In – Service Teacher Qualification program, teacher performance, successful teaching parameters, teaching quality.

1. Introduction

All systems that invest in professional capital admit that spending on education is an investment in human capital development from early childhood to adulthood. But, even if it is intended to make a turn in the field of education, investments should be made (Hargreaves & Fullan, 2012).

The pressures and demands on learning new skills for teamwork, more sophisticated thinking and successful use of new information technologies, have been a kind of appeal to new teaching styles in many countries (Hargreaves, 2000: 151). In this context, a new way of teaching and professional development of teachers was required.

In the light of changes taking place in education, the role of teachers in a modern school, and attempts to keep up with international countries, one of the conditions to fulfill the quality of the educational process, is the continuous development of teachers, raising classroom quality and improving teacher's performance (Bicaj, 2015: 117).

In – Service Teacher Qualification Program is also functional in Kosovo, which aims to lead towards the establishment of qualified teachers, towards achieving changes and improving teacher's performance in the classroom, aiming to raise the quality of teaching.

Teachers in Kosovo, among others, have been offered the opportunity to raise their qualifications, since 2006, in the so-called Teacher Training program while working. The program, now called In – Service Teacher Qualification Program in collaboration with the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MEST) and the University of Prishtina (UP), follows the concept and philosophy of lifelong learning (Berisha - Bicaj & Grapci - Kotori, 2013).

If we focus on our topic, we will see that on this topic, it is important to ask ourselves what is the effect of In – Service Teacher Qualification Program in raising the quality of teaching, what is the impact of program for further professional

development to attendees, which is the difference between 2 year higher pedagogical school qualified teachers, and In – Service Teacher Qualification program attendees, regarding the efficiency and performance at work? What is the interest of teachers for lifelong learning? What are the parameters of successful teaching?

The purpose of the paper: This paper aims: a) to identify efficiency at work of the qualified teachers and of those who did not qualify in the In – Service Teacher Qualification program; b) to see the performance indications/differences of these two teacher categories; c) to issue conclusions; d) to respond to the paper hypothesis, which states that the attendees of the program, are more efficient at work than qualified teachers in 2 year higher pedagogical School.

2. Literature review

To connect the intention of observing the classroom, the basic issues are briefly elaborated. To clarify the meaning of the term 'performance', we have relied on the Administrative Instruction (AI) no. 14/2013, which characterizes the meaning of the term, with the entire work of teachers, demonstrated through outreach activities and relevant documentation (MEST, 2013: 3).

Furthermore, administrative instructions in section 3, establishes standards of performance evaluation, which then, in the National Council for Teacher Licensing document, are disaggregated in competence and indicators. These standards, that are also the general description of teacher profession, are (KSHLM, 2012: 4-6):

- Commitment to the students and their learning,
- Professional knowledge,
- Teaching,
- Collaboration with colleagues, parents and the community,
- Continuous professional development,

- Responsibility and obligations at work:

In this occasion, regarding the research focus, during classroom observation, professional knowledge of teachers and teaching quality in the classroom are mainly observed. While the continuing professional development is a key factor, with direct impact on learning outcomes and improving teaching practice (KSHLM, 2012: 4), which simultaneously fulfills this part of the research and the importance of lifelong learning.

Professional knowledge, relating to the basic knowledge that teachers should have, for the use of teaching methods, curriculum, subject matter and current research on teaching.

Teaching connects teacher's knowledge through the application of various teaching strategies and adapting teaching methods to the needs of students. In this way, by analyzing the results of the students, if necessary, it improves the teaching practices (KSHLM, 2012: 4).

We can see that by all standards for assessing performance while observing the work of teachers in the classroom, we focused at two of them (see above). We considered that they are essential to achieve the desired success in the classroom. The lack of professional knowledge would have an impact on the performance of teachers, starting from planning of the lesson, application of methods and techniques, managing of the classrooms and determination of evaluation criteria.

If we have considered the standard of teaching as important, we have related to the fact that without a qualitative and well planned teaching, there will be no mutual cooperation and success in the classroom, on the way to building quality. But, if we have observation based on parameters of the successful teaching, it should be known which successful teaching parameters are!

Based on the Lee S. Shulman ideology, who is known for the field of pedagogical knowledge content in an article entitled: "Knowledge and Teaching: Foundations of the New Reform" we can note that he identifies the meaning of the content, character and source of basic teaching knowledge, as a response

to the normative intellectual and practical base, for the excellence of teaching, he defines and argues that by the submitted questions: What are the resources of the basic knowledge with the regard to teaching? Under what conditions these resources could be conceptualized? What is the process of pedagogical and operating reasoning? What are the implications for teaching policies and education reforms (Shulman S, 1987: 1-4).

Shulman, divides categories of basic knowledge into (Shulman S, 1987: 8):

- Content knowledge
- General pedagogical knowledge, with support on the principles and classroom management strategies
- Knowledge of the curriculum, with possession of materials and programs for teachers
- Pedagogical knowledge content that is considered to be a unique issue of teacher professional understanding
- Students knowledge and their characteristics
- Knowledge of educational contexts
- Knowledge of the values and educational goals.

We understand that pedagogical knowledge content represents the combination of content and pedagogy, in understanding of the organization and adaptation of the issues and problems being represented with different interests and abilities of students and being presented for guidance (Shulman S, 1987: 8).

Shulman, known as one of the first who dealt with the pedagogical knowledge content, emphasizes that a good teacher is not the one who knows only pedagogy, or only the course, but the one who knows the subject of pedagogy. Above, we had the opportunity to notice the kind of knowledge that he has set for a good teacher, which, although of 80's, is still valid and have even helped to modern time.

3. Research Methodology

For the realization of the paper and data analysis, quantitative and qualitative approach was used, appearing in statistical form. Data from observation in the classroom are as well analyzed.

Research methods

3.1 Theoretical analysis method

The method was applied to examine the available literature (mainly international literature) to verify the parameters of successful teaching.

3.2 Method of the pedagogical documentation

The method, which aimed to rely on the use and analysis of educational documents, in this case, the Administrative Instruction (AI) for the evaluating teacher's performance

3.3 Statistical method

This method was used, presenting the results from the observation in teaching process and analyzing them in SPSS. At the same time, this method allowed the appearance of relevant indicators in research, expression of data in a table, thus verifying hypotheses.

3.4 The comparison method

The purpose of such method is, comparing the results of the survey in class.

3.5 The technique of observation

Technique of observation aimed at monitoring and observing teachers in the classroom, or in the teaching process, in order to conclude what are the effects (if it has positive effects), which are reflected in classroom, to improve the quality of teaching. In order to ascertain differences, the performance of qualified teachers in the In – Service Teacher Qualification program and

the performance of qualified teachers in 2 year Higher Pedagogical School was observed. Previously, successful teaching parameters were explored. The instrument, which has been used for observation, was the observation protocol, which was designed based on National Council for Teacher Licensing document and Administrative Instruction (AI) of MEST for evaluating teacher's performance.

From the observation protocol, that was developed in 8 schools in Kosovo, exactly in one urban school and in one rural school in Pristina, Gjilan, Gjakova and Prizren, the results regarding the research requirements and hypothesis have been emerged.

Teachers, who have been observed, were mainly middle-aged, with a working experience of 10-30 yrs. and mostly class teachers (11) in relation to the subject courses teachers who have been observed (6). While, the course that was more observed, was the Albanian Language course.

Observation in the classroom lasted 15-25 min minimum and 30-40 min maximum. The number of students in those classes was approximately 20-30.

4. Findings and discussions

4.1 Results of observations data

Regarding the classroom observation, the data were processed through a combination of quantitative and qualitative approach, using descriptive way of interpreting the results, by directly observing in the classroom. In this case, the observation protocol has been used, by measuring the performance of teachers in the classroom (see above).

Regarding the evaluation of the performance of teachers, such as organizing the class, the class structure, the application of methods and techniques, developed activities etc., in 8 schools in Kosovo, 2 year Higher Pedagogical School qualified teachers and teachers qualified in In – Service Teacher Qualification program were observed. In order to realize the

observation and research in general, a special permission was obtained from the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology.

According to the National Council for the Teacher Licensing document, a teacher's performance can be measured through these aspects (KSHLM, 2012: 36):

- Positive atmosphere in the classroom,
- Time management,
- Involvement of all the students in activities,
- Structure of meaningful situations,
- Understanding development of the students,
- Understanding evaluation of the students,
- Development of autonomy.

Every teacher observed, was evaluated based on each activity that was developed in the classroom, giving excuse for the evaluation. Activities were evaluated based on observing, starting from level: a) unsatisfactory; b) satisfactory; c) good; d) excellent.

4.2 Analysis of observing data - Analysis of the cross - tabulation of qualifications

Particular importance in the analysis of the survey protocol has cross – tabulation analysis according to the qualified teachers who were observed. The following matters clarify this.

Questions that measure the observed teachers' performance in the classroom

From direct observation of teaching, to evaluate objectively teachers' performance differences, the results were surprising.

Regarding the creating a positive atmosphere in the classroom (characterized by: behavioral fulfillment, eventual irregularities in the classroom, the use of sarcasm, respect among students, respect between teachers and pupils, etc.) (KSHLM 2012: 36 -37), in the

category of evaluating an excellent atmosphere was observed, with a higher margin of 7.5 percentage points, more classes were led by teachers with 2 year Higher Pedagogical School qualification. However, in the categories of lower assessments, the In – Service Teacher Qualification program attendees have a distribution which is skewed more of a positive assessment. Therefore, when compared, teachers who create a higher ranked atmosphere, the In – Service Teacher Qualification program teachers remain behind, but in categories with lower ratings, there is a significant positive difference to the side of the teachers participating in the In – Service Teacher Qualification program. However, in this performance category, there are differences that are statistically significant (both tests, such as Chi-square, also Fisher's exact test, have *p* values that exceed for 10% margin of error).

Table 1. Analysis of the qualifications cross - tabulation for the atmosphere in the classroom

Chi-Square Tests

	Value	Df	Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)	Exact Sig. (2-sided)	Exact Sig. (1-sided)	Point Probability
Pearson Chi-Square	2.091 ^a	2	.352	.569		
Likelihood Ratio	2.524	2	.283	.569		
Fisher's Exact Test	1.967			.569		
Linear-by-Linear Association	.000 ^b	1	1.000	1.000	.644	.287
N of Valid Cases	16					

a) 4 cells (66.7%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is .50.

b) The standardized statistic is .000.

The maximum rating, in this case, belongs to the category "excellent" and the justification for that is:

- Despite that class was adjusted according to the traditional ways, a pleasant atmosphere in the classroom was identified,
- Mutual respect and cooperation,
- Positivism;

In the case of the rural region of Gjilan, where the evaluation was not as high and reached the level "Not satisfactory", we have provided the following explanation:

- There were occasionally not good communication and insufficient concentration between students;

When the teacher's performance criterion is measured with time management (characteristics of which are: maximum use of time for activities, instructions and explanations by the teacher during the lesson, well use of the time available, etc.) (KSHLM, 2012: 38), in the highest categories of assessment, teachers with 2-year Higher Pedagogical School qualification still showed better performance. However, in the average of all participants, teachers who are participating in the In – Service Teacher Qualification program have shown better skills of time management. This difference is statistically verified through Chi-square test and Fisher's exact test in the margin of error of 10% (p-values of 0.078 and 0097 respectively).

Table 2. Analysis of cross - tabulation with qualification according to time management

Chi-Square Tests

	Value	df	Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)	Exact Sig. (2-sided)	Exact Sig. (1-sided)	Point Probability
Pearson Chi-Square	5.091 ^a	2	.078	.097		
Likelihood	7.023	2	.030	.097		

Arberore Bicaj- Performance observation of qualified teachers in the In-Service Teacher Qualification program

Ratio Fisher's Exact Test	4.334			.097		
Linear-by-Linear Association	.118 ^b	1	.731	1.000	.500	.251
N of Valid Cases	16					

a. 4 cells (66.7%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is 1.00.

b. The standardized statistic is .344.

The table shows that in general, priority positive responses have been identified, and reasoning for this is:

- All the time available, was in favor of the learning process,
- Teacher used the time available for activities.

The teacher's performance criteria in the involvement of all students in the learning activities (involvement of a large part of the students in activities, the teacher is a facilitator and guide to the requirements of students, use strategies for involving students in learning activities, organizes work groups, pushing students to take roles within the group) (KSHLM, 2012: 39-40), there is a huge positive difference of the In – Service Teacher Qualification program participants in the category of excellent evaluation. However, for all observed teachers, there was no difference on average, that is statistically significant (p-values exceed the margin of error of 10%).

Table 3. Analysis of the cross – tabulation regarding the involvement of students in activities

Chi-Square Tests

	Value	df	Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)	Exact Sig. (2-sided)	Exact Sig. (1-sided)	Point Probability
Pearson Chi-Square	1.167 ^a	2	.558	.782		
Likelihood Ratio	1.185	2	.553	.782		
Fisher's Exact Test	1.377			.782		
Linear-by-Linear Association	.484 ^b	1	.487	.730	.365	.214
N of Valid Cases	16					

a. 6 cells (100.0%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is 1.00.

b. The standardized statistic is .696.

It is notable that with regards to inclusion of all students in learning activities, the positive assessment level of "excellent" is dominating, the reason is as following:

- Work of students in groups,
- All students engaged and stimulated to work,

Despite the positive assessment, a level of evaluation "satisfactory" can be also shown while the reason for this is the:

- Lack of teamwork and the lack of students activity;

To 'structures of meaningful situations', where there were monitoring these activities, such as:

1. Teacher's instructions at the beginning of learning process,
2. Established objectives of learning,

3. Instruments and techniques used,
 4. Linking of concepts or educational content in teaching,
 5. Repetition of lessons at the end of the learning process (KSHLM, 2012: 41), there were differences between Higher Pedagogical School qualified teachers and attendees of the In – Service Teacher Qualification program. In classes of Higher Pedagogical School qualified teachers, there is a greater success (having positive assessment 100%), while in classes of qualified teachers in In – Service Teacher Qualification program (37%).

In this performance criteria, there were positive differences of teachers qualified in Higher Pedagogical School, which confirmed the statistically low p-values of Chi-square test and Fisher's exact test in very low margin of error of 1% (p-values 00:01 and 0.007, respectively).

Table 4. Cross-tabulation with qualification according to meaningful learning structures

Chi-Square Tests

	Value	df	Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)	Exact Sig. (2-sided)	Exact Sig. (1-sided)	Point Probability
Pearson Chi-Square	9.143 ^a	2	.010	.007		
Likelihood Ratio	12.620	2	.002	.007		
Fisher's Exact Test	8.742			.007		
Linear-by-Linear Association	2.872 ^b	1	.090	.157	.078	.057
N of Valid Cases	16					

a. 6 cells (100.0%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is 2.00.

b. The standardized statistic is -1.695.

In this occasion, evaluation relates to the following reasons:

- Teacher gives required instructions for learning,
- Repetition at the end of the lesson;

Reasons for an assessment level "satisfactory" that is identified in the rural part of Gjilan:

- Application of traditional teaching methods,
- Reading of a topic throughout the lesson;

Also the "development of understanding of the students" (adaptation of the duties and of the situations that students recognize/know, access to tasks critically, instruction repetition by the teacher as appropriate, students reflect, explain, describe, synthesize, derive meanings, compare, analyze) (KSHLM, 2012: 42) in the classes of the teachers qualified in Higher Pedagogical School, was more successful (with a marked difference), because to attendees of In – Service Teacher Qualification program, is presented a situation "not satisfactory", which appears for the first time and reaches the percentage of 25%. While, 100% positive situation regarding to this issue, is in the classes of Higher Pedagogical School qualified teachers. Even the issue formally is confirmed through statistical tests on the margin of error of 5% (p-value 0.027 Chi-square test, p-value 0.013 Fisher's exact test).

Tab. 5 Cross- tabulation by developing understanding among students

Chi-Square Tests

	Value	df	Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)	Exact Sig. (2-sided)	Exact Sig. (1-sided)	Point Probability
Pearson Chi-Square	9.143 ^a	3	.027	.009		
Likelihood	12.620	3	.006	.009		

Ratio Fisher's Exact Test	8.291			.013		
Linear-by-Linear Association	1.384 ^b	1	.239	.360	.180	.100
N of Valid Cases	16					

a. 8 cells (100.0%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is 1.00.

b. The standardized statistic is -1.176.

During observation of the activity, (in the same region identified above) was also received a negative evaluation "unsatisfactory", on the ground:

- No combination of learning with situations that students know in advance,
 - Meaningful reading was not applied;
- The positive assessment is verified by reasoning:
- The use of teaching methods leads to the development of understanding of the students,
 - Through questions, fostering reflection, synthesis, understandings have been achieved by students;

At the same time, even on "Assessment of student understanding" (which is characterized by asking questions and checking by the teacher, monitoring during teamwork, management of questions and misunderstandings of students, promoting students' abilities to reflect and analyze the process of learning etc.) (KSHLM, 2012: 43), the performance of In – Service Teacher Qualification program attendees, appears in a dose 12.5% of the alternatives "unsatisfactory", but the rest of percentages are positive. While, to a teacher of Higher Pedagogical School, no negative alternatives are given. Best performance of Higher Pedagogical School qualified teachers is also statistically confirmed with the error margin of 5% by

Fisher's exact test (p-value 0.031) and 10% by Chi-square test (p-value 0.082).

Tab. 6 Cross –tabulation with qualification by understanding of the students

Chi-Square Tests

	Value	df	Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)	Exact Sig. (2-sided)	Exact Sig. (1-sided)	Point Probability
Pearson Chi-Square	6.705 ^a	3	.082	.059		
Likelihood Ratio	7.616	3	.055	.113		
Fisher's Exact Test	6.381			.059		
Linear-by-Linear Association	4.364 ^b	1	.037	.061	.031	.025
N of Valid Cases	16					

a. 8 cells (100.0%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is .50.

b. The standardized statistic is -2.089.

Once more, appears the level "not satisfactory", but lower scale. While positive reasons are linked with the following:

- Teachers assistance in cases where there is uncertainty and tasks,
- Application of different techniques for interviewing and checking;;

Again, "Development of autonomy" of teachers who have completed the In – Service Teacher Qualification program, appears not to be in favor of this category of teachers. In contrast, from Higher Pedagogical School qualified teachers, we

have here a negative percentage of 25%. However, differences in the performance criteria, on average are not statistically significant.

Development of autonomy is measured by:

- Encouraging the habit of students to choose between tasks or exercises,
- Encouraging students to think and explore independently, by drawing conclusions,
- Promoting students work in the team, identifying strategies used for selecting tasks, its manipulation for solving problems etc (KSHLM, 2012: 44).

Table 7. Cross-tabulation through the development of autonomy

Chi-Square Tests

	Value	df	Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)	Exact Sig. (2-sided)	Exact Sig. (1-sided)	Point Probability
Pearson Chi-Square	2.311 ^a	2	.315	.608		
Likelihood Ratio	3.085	2	.214	.478		
Fisher's Exact Test	2.017			.608		
Linear-by-Linear Association	1.812 ^b	1	.178	.318	.159	.103
N of Valid Cases	16					

a. 6 cells (100.0%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is 1.00.

b. The standardized statistic is -1.346.

During the activity "the observation of autonomy", we highlighted the evaluation of the average "good" unlike other

activities observed. This assessment relates to the grounds that:

- There is no student autonomy developed,
- The teacher encourages the answers but without giving opportunity to students to think;

On the other hand, by receiving a negative evaluation (rural part of Gjakova and Gjilan), we are dealing with:

- All the learning process depends on the teacher,
- Absolutely no incentive to work independently;

During the observation, among others, the creativity of teachers who were observed, working conditions, atmosphere and ambiance at school, the level of students, etc have been noted. There were no differences between the conditions of work, enthusiasm among teachers and the atmosphere within the school. In general, it was also noted uncertainty among teachers, and a reaction (with a coldness and indifference) to the request for observation. But, this did not happen at all schools. Teachers, who by nature are resourceful and creative, have accepted the request for observation in the classroom with pleasure. While, for others, with the lack of self-confidence, more precise clarification related to the purpose of observation, with the confidentiality observation contained and with the flexibility and neutrality required during the performance observation in the classroom was needed. Thus, the eventual dilemmas, among teachers who underwent observation, are avoided.

For each class of observation, the protocol of observation was recorded and completed, aiming to identify the real situation of a lesson. Results are presented above, while discussions about the results will be presented in the discussions chapter.

In addition, we have managed to observe that, exactly on the data from the observation; a weak side of the teachers from Gjilan was identified (the rural part only).

Also, a case that should be mentioned has to do with the readiness of a mathematic teachers and students, despite the fact that a mathematic course was not planned, they were prepared for the changes. Such a willingness to find similar alternatives was to be assessed positively.

Classroom observation brings us to the statement that small number of students per class in rural schools, should lead to great successes. Even in a classroom of the primary school in Arbane- municipality of Prizren, Roma community students were presented in a significant number.

Discussions

The issue, which verifies the performance indications of qualified teachers in In – Service Teacher Qualification program, was measured through observation of the teachers' performance in the learning process. In this case, given hypotheses and research questions were verified and have been defined as following:

- *Teachers qualified in the In – Service Teacher Qualification program are more effective at work (teaching) than those who are not qualified.*
- *What are the indications of the performance of In – Service Teacher Qualification program qualified teachers and unqualified ones in the program?*

The issue of creating a positive atmosphere in the classroom and time management criteria belongs to Higher Pedagogical School (HPS) qualified teachers, who according to the results, are identified as the best leaders with this regard. But, if we get the lower assessment, positive assessment belongs to the program attendees.

On the other hand, we can see from the results that in the performance measurement, with the **inclusion of all students in learning activities**, lead the qualified teachers in In-Service Teacher Qualification program in the criteria of

higher assessment, while on average assessment, there have been no statistically significant difference. While, on **the meaningful structure situation**, a great success is significantly observed at teachers with HPS, with 100% positive assessment.

Measurement **development of student's understanding** is significantly in favor of HPS Qualified teachers, which comes through identifying the level "not satisfying" at teachers who have completed the In-Service Teacher Qualification program, which shows the level of assessment on a percentage of 25%.

A student by understanding an assessment also assesses the HPS teacher, by not having negative alternatives. The performance assessed, in terms of **autonomy development**, no statistically significant differences have been noticed, but again it is in favor of HPS's teachers.

5. Conclusions

Classroom observation, the identification of differences in performance of the program attendees and HPS-qualified teachers, have lead us to the following conclusions:

- Based on results and data analysis, we can conclude that, despite participation in the program, attendees (teachers) are not more distinguished in the learning process comparing to their colleagues with a 2 yrs HPS qualification.
- However, the main and most rewarding place for the use of innovative teaching methods in the classroom, and the performance and success in class, takes the organized training programs after the war in Kosovo, when the first implementation of the entire educational system reform in general was done and the learning process began as well.
- Regarding to this issue, we can also conclude that the interest, desire and willingness of how the teachers

work, in terms of positive changes in class, resulted in improved performance, while quality is an individual issue.

- During the monitoring of teachers performance, we came to the conclusion that there is a weak performance in the classroom of the teachers in Gjilan (only in rural parts).

This makes us understand that the hypothesis (remember: *Qualified teachers are more effective at work (teaching) than those who are not qualified in the In – Service Teacher Qualification program*) has not been verified, without noticing positive indications on the performance of the program attendees unlike qualified teachers with a 2 yrs. HPS. (Remember the research question: *What are the indications of the performance of In – Service Teacher Qualification program qualified teachers and unqualified ones in the program?*)

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Hargreaves A, & Fullan M, "The power of professional capital". *Learning Forwards Annual Conference* <http://store.learningforward.org>, 34, pp. 36-39. Boston Mass, (2013).

Hargreaves A, "Four Ages of Professionalism and Professional Learning". *Teacher and teaching: History and Practice*, (2000): 151.

KSHLM, "Kriteret dhe procedurat për vlerësimin e performancës" MASHT, Prishtinë, (2012).

MASHT, "Udhëzim administrativ nr. 14/2013". *Vlerësimi i performancës së mësimdhënësve*, Prishtinë, . (2013).

- Shulman, S. Lee. (1987). Knowledge and Teaching: Foundations of the New Reform. *Harvard Educational Review*. Vol.57/1. President and Fellows of harvard College. Stanford University.
- Bicaj A, "Kualifikimi i Mësimdhënësve në kuadër të politikave të të mësuarit gjatë gjithë jetës" Phd thesis – unpublished. (2015): 117.
- Berisha - Bicaj A & Grapci - Kotori, L, "Programi Avancimi i Kualifikimit të Mësimdhënësve, funksionimi dhe sfidat" *The 1st International Conference on Research and Education – Challenges Toward the Future (ICRAE2013)*, University of Shkodra "Luigj Gurakuqi", Shkodra, Albania, 24-25 May, 2013. <http://konferenca.unishk.edu.al/icrae2013/icraecd2013/doc/124.pdf>.