

---

## Emergence, Development and Challenges of Fethullah Movement in Nigeria, 1998-2016

BASHIR TAHIR USMAN

Prof. MADYA

Dr. BAKRI BIN MAT

Dr. SITTI DARWINDA BINT MOHAMED PERO

Ghazali Shafi'i School of International Studies, Utara Universitie, Malaysia

BASHIR TAHIR USMAN

Dr. USMAN MUHAMMAD MUSA

Dr. JIBRIN HUSSAINI

Postgraduate School, Department of History and War Studies  
Nigerian Defence Academy, Kaduna, Nigeria

### Abstract

*African countries witnessed tremendous change in the field of international relations with the recent growing presence of Turkey's diplomatic exploits as an economic power on the continent. Humanitarian projects carried out by Turkey in a number of African states such as Niger, Sudan and Mali bear clear testimony to this fact. This paper examines the Nigeria/Turkey relation which involves mutual interest and cooperation in a number of strategic areas, such as supply of military hardware, trade and commerce. In addition, the paper studies the emergence, development and challenges of Fethullah Gulen Movement in Nigeria between 1998-2016. How harmonious was the relationship between the Turkish state and non-state actors before they fell out of each other. The conflict reached its climax after the July 15<sup>th</sup> abortive coup attempt on AKP-led administration of which members of Gulen movement were accused of complicity. This prompted the Turkish government to outlaw the organization and charge it of terrorism, and consequently launch an international campaign for massive crackdown on the Hizmet Movement all over the World. The question here is can they stand resiliently in the face of their home state hostilities that threaten the very foundation of their existence? How do they cope with being uprooted from their home base?*

*How their widespread network of schools' institutions, peace dialogue, philanthropic projects, business concerns and many more survive the aggressive pursuit by their home-state here in Africa specifically Nigeria? The Turkish foreign policy in this context failed to win the concurrence of Nigerian state to shut down Gulen's institutions in Nigeria but succeeded only in having the phrase "Turkish" removed from their schools in the country. The study will take a critical look at the strength of Nigeria-Turkey relations. Published works will critically be examined using qualitative method of research.*

**Keywords:** Fethullah Movement, International Relations, Diplomacy, Nigeria, Turkey.

## INTRODUCTION

In the contemporary international system, some private individuals distinguished themselves as philanthropists who provide different kinds of life-relief materials free of charge in their communities, regions, nations and international communities by extension. These private individuals in many situations established personal foundations under which their activities are carried out. A distinguished personality in this effort is Fethullah Gulen from Turkey, South-East Europe. With the ideology that impacting knowledge to young people requires cumbersome fiscal inputs, Gulen focused on this course and also empowering like-minded Turkish nationals with wealth generated from the integration of the free market. The Movement (Gulen Movement or Hizmet Movement or Fethullah Gulen Movement) is a nonformal and distributed association viewing Fethullah Gulen as a role model. It encompasses büyükabiler (The Great Elders) saddled with the responsibility of coordinating the movement's activities and finances [1].

The movement is made up of communities embracing the changing world order without leaving behind their originality in terms of faith and culture. Despite millions of followers' we see the leader as a source of inspiration, he is also feared and viewed as a threat to his home country, Turkey [2]. That misconception has

therefore not slowed down his contributions to global peace and development through his social and educational activities as a Muslim intellectual leader with the goal of developing a new sense of religiosity [3].

The multiplicity of religious and cultural composition of the Nigerian society provides a conducive atmosphere for the proper implementation of the Gulen’s worldview. The Nigerian Turkish International College, founded by Fethullah Gulen, was designed to make a significant contribution to the Nigerian educational system. Inspired by Gulen’s thought, those schools made and are still making enormous contribution to the development of peace, tolerance, dialogue, and foreign policy in a meaningful way.

Formal establishments with religious and spiritual background dedicated to non-profit making endeavours that translate to public good are known as Faith-Based Organizations (FBO). This usually consists of charitable projects, peace initiatives, educational institutions based on a non-profit philosophy, autonomous, charitable foundation to encourage and comprehend mutually expressed thoughts about the common good of all [4]. Fethullah Gulen is considered an Islamic intellectual and of jihadist Sufi Ottoman tradition with a contentious history and numerous supporters and devotees in both the Islamic and Western worlds. He is regarded as the spiritual leader of an Islamic socio-political organization that extends all over the globe, with schools and institutions spread in more than 120 countries, including the United States (U.S) [5].

The Gulen’s worldview of interfaith dialogue between Muslims and Christians is in concurrence with which is gradually gaining currency nowadays among the progressive Muslims [6]. The indispensability of the movement's treasured values to decision-makers and policy-makers caught up in an intellectual battle against the cleavages and threat of terrorism and bigotry. A detailed examination of the four primary constituents of civility — “tolerance, cooperation, reciprocity, and trust” – reveals the critical importance of the Gülen movement's wisdoms and viewpoint in guaranteeing and attaining ideal civil societies [7]. In countries that are profoundly diverged along ethnic and religious lines, Gülen movement schools have succeeded in promoting honesty, harmony, and tête-à-tête [8].

Mr. Gülen's enormous live and taped public lectures which was distributed across Turkey drew people to his messages. His audience was largely low- to middle-income businessmen, few wealthy ones as well as students of tertiary institutions. Apart from the lectures, he also supported people with monetary contributions as well as manpower resources and this was also a selling point to attract people to his ideals. He was the backbone behind the establishments of the "houses of light" where Islamic education was studied based on Nursi's writings and his own teachings, in a variation of the Nur movement dershanes [9]. Thousands more educators would later compose the faculty of schools founded on Mr. Gülen's educational philosophy, and these "houses of light" became a source for them. This was the point in Mr. Gülen's career when a group of around a hundred people began to emerge as a service group, that is, a group that joined together around his notion of community service [10].

As a result, a historical assessment of the new everchanging and anticipated trajectory of the Gulen movement (GM) in the aftermath of the attempted coup on 15 July 2016 in Turkey and the Turkish state's subsequent crackdown. The topic of GM survival is nothing short of an experiential crisis for the movement, with members stranded in exile outside the country.

As stated by Turkish affairs scholar Hakan Yavuz, the movement consists of transnational non-governmental groups, which are capable of various international diplomacies without the involvement of their own governments by their very nature [11]. According to their objectives, these organizations can bring about peace through cultural, social, and political initiatives. In modern times, international organizations are the most important pillars of the global order. Comprehending these groups increases one's understanding of the modus operandi of international systems. The Gulen movement likewise follows neoliberal logic in expanding and transforming its corporate networks, which include insurance businesses and banks, to name a few, into an Islamic-based economic empire [12]. To further its Islamic objective, the movement established mass media, including newspapers, magazines, radio, and television. Furthermore, the movement created educational institutions all over the world for the cause of da'wa, which means

"preaching of the gospel," and its objective to deliver the so-called golden generations of Muslims.

The Gulen's worldview would perfectly work for a cosmopolitan composition of a nation like Nigeria as it portrays complex ethno-religious mix-up, and the individuals have to live together in harmony. Thus, their interfaith dialogue initiative is of immense relevance in promoting peace and conflict resolution. The ethnic composition of the country consists of well above 250 ethnic groups spread across the federation of Nigeria. The country is blessed with massive oil reserve yet ironically with relatively high poverty rate [13].

Nigerian Turkish International College (NTICs) was established in September 1998 as a pioneer experiment at least from Turkey in Cairo Street, Wuse2, Abuja with barely 76 students became the first of its kind in the country. It was registered under the management of SURAT Educational Institutions Limited [14].

The Nigeria/Turkey relationship has witnessed over the years a robust growth in both trade and diplomacy that translates on the increased cordiality of their relationship. In spite of this, very few studies were conducted in this area especially in relation to the activities of Fethullah Gulen movement. Having identified this gap, this paper intends to it by providing a study on the emergence, development and challenges of Fethullah Gulen Movement in relation to Nigeria/Turkey relations.

## **IMPACT OF FETHULLAH GULEN'S MOVEMENT ON INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS (DIPLOMACY)**

It is never in dispute that foreign policies are methods used by states to transact with one another. It all comes down to what governments choose to do or not do with other countries [15]. Trade deals, diplomatic agreements, military collaboration, sanctions etc. despite the fact that the essence of these policies is to satisfy the interests of the countries in question, they can occasionally be of terrible consequences, such as causing larger issues than the ones they were intended to solve, obstructing government agendas, and even causing governments to fail. "Policy disasters", "policy blunders", and now

“policy failure” have all been used to explain these negative consequences. Comprehending failure of policies is important for fully comprehending the consequences of foreign policy, especially because national governments place a high value on foreign policy success, which is often defined as achieving predetermined objectives [16].

The viability of the Turkish foreign policy toward African countries generally, and particularly Nigeria can measure only within the context of its benefit to citizens of both countries. As a result, on a broad level, the political and economic interests provide basis for Nigeria-Turkey relations, for the two, as much inextricable as they are, define the basis of any bilateral and multilateral relations in contemporary international system. Thus, the economic and political strengths represent the most inextricably powerful interests that determine the degree of influence of any nation state in the world system of today. Therefore, a country may decide to exercise its economic power over another country which must unavoidably translate to political power, for political power can never be separated from economic power [17]. Turkey and Nigeria have had solid diplomatic relations for many years. Both the countries have exhibited willingness to further strengthen bilateral ties in important areas. The two, for example, enjoy membership of quite a number of transnational bodies such Organization of Islamic Conference (OIC) and Developing Eight (D-8) in international organizations, which has resulted in strong cooperation. The two countries' commercial and economic relations are likewise quickly developing. Since 2004, the bilateral trade volume has more than tripled, reaching 1.144,9 million USD in 2015, added to this is the Turkey's oil and LNG imports. As of 2014, Nigeria is Turkey's top trade partner in Sub-Saharan Africa [18].

## **HISTORY OF DIPLOMATIC RELATION BETWEEN NIGERIA AND TURKEY**

Over the years, commerce with African countries would have been unthinkable in Turkish society, today, however, the story is different as quite a number of business people from Turkey make huge investment in Nigerian economy, resulting in great returns on

investment for both the countries. Going by the report of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFA) of the Republic of Turkey (2017), the history of Turkey-Nigeria diplomatic relations can be traced back to the period before the Nigeria's independence in 1960. Turkey established its first embassy in Lagos, Nigeria's then city, two years after the country's independence, in August 1962. The Turkish Embassy relocated to Abuja in 2001 after Nigeria's capital city was shifted to the more central state of Abuja in 1991. Turkey and Nigeria have maintained good diplomatic relations over the years, which has led to increased commerce and collaboration. The Nigerian government, for example, has lately made Turkey a strategic partner in the fight against Boko Haram by purchasing T-129 assault helicopters to assist in the fight against terrorism [19]. Turkey and Nigeria are considered to have the political will to further improve bilateral relations in strategic areas [20].

## **GULEN MOVEMENT IN SUB-SAHARAN AFRICA**

The Gülen movement and the AKP administration worked together from 2003 to 2013, with each party gaining from the other's support. Business and education have served as foundations in Ankara's diplomatic relations with the Sub-Saharan African region. As a result, the African authorities saw the Gülen Movement's private organizations (schools, business associations, and dialogue platforms) as bridges to a deeper engagement with the Turkish government. Turkish governmental and private actors were seen as part of the same coalition by African authorities. By 2013, the Gülen Movement had established over 100 schools in over 50 African countries and was working closely with the Turkish government on the ground. However, when confrontation between the Gülen movement and the AKP erupted in December 2013, and notably after the failed coup of 15 July 2016, which the government blamed on the so-called "Fethullahç Terör rgütü" ("FET"), this strategic cooperation came to an end in Turkey. The crisis took on an international dimension as it spread across Sub-Saharan Africa [21].

## **IMPACT OF FETHULLAH GULEN'S MOVEMENT ON INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS BETWEEN NIGERIA AND TURKEY**

Nigerian Turkish International Colleges (NTIC) now operates 17 colleges scattered across the country and in the Federal Capital Territory (FCT) [22]. Over the years, the school has been acknowledged for its accomplishments on both a national and international level. It has grown to include over 1000 experienced and certified academic and non-academic professionals from both local and foreign backgrounds who provide qualitative education to over 4000 students representing 30 diverse nationalities across six states in Nigeria [23]. Nile University of Nigeria (NILE) was founded eleven years after the NTICs were formed. Similarly, since its inception, the university has experienced enormous expansion. NILE launched with 93 students and three faculties (Arts & Social Sciences, Engineering, and Natural & Applied Sciences) now boasts around 4000 undergraduate and postgraduate students, 34 undergraduate programs spread across six faculty, and 47 postgraduate programs spread across five faculties [24]. These institutions are run as "non-profit corporations or trusts," with all revenues going back to the students in the form of educational investments (new teaching materials and resources such as books, computers, software; and facilities such as labs, gyms, hostels, residence halls, etc.) [25].

The relationship between Turkey and African countries has taken a drastic shift, owing to an increase in Turkish investment connected with the period of economic expansion from 2009 to 2016. Turkey had an annual GDP growth rate of 7.17 percent until the failed coup in 2016, which caused the country's GDP growth rate to dip to 2.9 percent [26]. Many Turkish businesses operate in Nigeria, primarily in the construction, industrial production and energy sectors. It is therefore a fact that Gulen. The Gulen name and its affiliated groups has a "camouflage" characteristic its inception in the 1970s. This uncertain identification stems from the movement's informality and secretive culture, which has taken on various shapes over time. The movement has been known to operate in fifty-four



African countries since its first engagement in 1994 and has become the backbone of Turkish public diplomacy on the continent [27].

Nevertheless, a huge stumbling block between Turkey and Nigeria occurred as a result of Turkey's attempted coup. Nigeria had been asked by Turkey's struggling government to de-recognize Turkish educational institutions created by the Gulen movement. Nigeria, like many other African countries, has long had Gulen movement investments. These investments have increased the economy's worth and helped to create jobs. As a result, this is critical for Nigeria and its population. However, at the height of the coup attempt, Turkey pressed Nigeria to close Gulen schools and other investments, as well as to remove the word "Turkey" from any Gulen-related materials [28].

## **THE IMPLICATIONS OF THE JULY 15 FAILED COUP ATTEMPT ON DIPLOMATIC TRIANGLE**

As seen, the Gülenist movement played a crucial role in the formulation and implementation of Turkey's opening to Africa between 2005 and 2014. The schism between Recep Tayyip Erdoan's government and the Gülen movement, on the other hand, sparked conflict within Turkish institutions, with ramifications far beyond the country's boundaries. Since 2014, the Turkish government has pursued a policy of pressing and, if feasible, shutting down the movement's domestic and international organizations. At the same time, Turkey has changed its multi-stakeholder strategy by establishing its own para-public entities that can work with other private parties. The Turkish authorities designated the Gülen movement's Network and activities as a terrorist organization, naming it the Fetullah Gülen Terrorist Organization (FETO), just weeks before the failed coup attempt by the movement's affiliates. As a result of the July 15 coup, Ankara has forced to expand its involvement in the conflict overseas, countering Gülenist propaganda and recruitment efforts. Turkey has been pressuring African leaders to shut down any activities associated to the movement, particularly revenue-generating groups, in order to achieve this goal [29].

## **Closure of Gulen Schools in Nigeria – An Implication of the Coup Attempt**

The Turkish government approached the Nigerian government in 2016, requesting that all Gulen schools be closed due to their ties to the Gulen Movement, which Turkey has labeled a terrorist group. The Nigerian response to this call was a barrage of protests. Despite the appeal, 17 Gulen-affiliated schools and one university remained operational, however their names had to be changed to remove any references to Turkey [30]. This bitter relationship between the Turkish government and the Hizmet Movement caused negative effects on its schools and students in Nigeria. In addition, the Turkish government also deported Nigerian students attending the HM schools and HM linked university in Turkey.

Nigerian society and governments have increasingly granted Gulen-inspired schools legitimacy, support, and respect. Permissive political climates allowed schools to demonstrate their academic excellence in the eyes of Nigerians at first. The achievement of pupils from the schools on a national and worldwide level gave the schools and the movement positive credibility. When the Turkish government began a negative campaign against the HM schools, their credibility and reputation helped them avoid being closed down by Nigeria.

## **GULEN MOVEMENT AND TURKEY FOREIGN POLICY – SUCCESS AND FAILURE**

Over the years, a great number of people have been closely following Turkish foreign policy. Academics have attempted to encapsulate the shifts and conceptualizations that have resulted in the new front of Turkish foreign policy [31]. However, the attempted coup de tat in Turkey revealed a big negative or policy failure between Turkey and Nigeria. Nigeria had been asked by Turkey's embattled government to de-recognize Turkish educational institutions created by the Gulen movement. Nigeria, like many African countries, has had long-term involvement in the Gulen movement. These investments have increased the economy's value and produced jobs, which is beneficial to Nigeria and its citizens. Turkey, on the other hand, put pressure on Nigeria to close Gulen schools and other investments, or to remove the

word "Turkey" from all things related to the movement, right before the coup. Since then, the two countries' romance has reached a low point. It got increasingly difficult for the two to resolve their disagreements at some point. A number of Nigerians linked to the movement were deported by Turkey. As a result, there was a diplomatic spat. The action of Turkey was interpreted by Nigerian authorities as a sign of trust and a payback for what happened during the management of Gulen movement investments in Nigeria. Prior to the coup d'état, Turkey enjoyed a clean connection with black Africa for many years. This, on the other hand, could be linked to the region's ties to the Ottoman Empire. For many Sub-Saharan Africans, the Ottoman Empire is still seen as the center. Turkey's image throughout Africa and abroad has been affected by the United States' classification of Turkey as a secular Muslim country. Turkey has been a role model for Nigeria and other African countries as a result of this [32].

Furthermore, both countries' partnerships have been credited with achievements in the fight against terrorism. Nigeria has made Turkey a vital partner in the fight against Boko Haram since the beginning of the insurgency. The T-129 attack helicopters were purchased by Nigeria to aid in the fight against terrorism. Nigeria has been a long-time purchaser of Turkish arms. Nigeria has purchased weaponry that have aided in the fight against internal conflicts and revolutions. One of the many critical weapons Nigeria has purchased from Turkey is Otokar's Cobra armoured personnel carriers. Turkey and Nigeria have become closer as a result of their strategic anti-terrorism alliance. This is one of several reasons that have influenced the current status of relations between Turkey and Nigeria. Turkey has gradually gained a foothold in the market and service economy. China, India, and Norway are its competitors. Turkey has been able to stay ahead of its competitors thanks to the federal system's framework. Because Turkey is portrayed as a Muslim country, this is the case. Nigeria's 36 states sign memorandums of understanding, agreements, and collaborations on their own. Nigeria is home to over 18 Muslim-majority states. Because Turkey is a Muslim country, these countries believe it is safer to deal with it. However, because Nigeria is a secular country including Muslims, Christians, and

traditional worshippers, this is an unofficial formula. Given the two countries' shared history, Turkey's takeover of China is all the more likely.

The Turkish policy has had no difficulty in penetrating the Nigerian market, particularly the military industry. The continuation of Turkey-Nigeria relations suggests, first and foremost, a mutually advantageous relationship that underpins foreign policy success. The many bilateral relations that both countries have had point to policy-making, decision-making, and political successes. Furthermore, the expansion of commerce between the two countries implies that the outcomes of both countries' economic negotiations have continued to fulfil expectations.

## **CONCLUSION**

The relationship between Turkey and Nigeria in terms of foreign policy was examined in this paper. It indicated that both countries' relations had improved over time, culminating in foreign policy accomplishments. Both countries have had informal and official interactions that have aided in the initial strengthening of the relationship's goals. The public diplomacy of the Gülen movement in Africa was conducted using a multi-track method. It swiftly became Turkey's most active and representative non-state player, notably in the field of public diplomacy, due to its significant presence in the state machinery and the experience it gained on the African continent.

However, the review discovered that, like most foreign policies, Turkey-Nigeria ties have not been without policy mistakes. That is, not being able to gain acceptance in the policy-making, decision-making, and political processes. The Turkish government's failed attempt to stifle its perceived enemy, the Gulen movement, via investments in Nigeria exemplified this. Its execution would deprive Nigeria and its population of the benefits of investments that the Turkish government wanted to stop. As a result, Turkey-Nigeria relations, like any other, are primarily based on mutual benefits for both parties. To avoid a total breakdown of bilateral relations, it is recommended that foreign policy be shielded from political vendetta

and that participating nations clamp down on acts. It is also suggested that Turkish companies in Nigeria engage in more corporate social responsibility projects.

It is vital to analyse the Gulen movement's triumphs and shortcomings from the perspective of global governance and as a worldwide social movement, and to determine whether it can serve as a model for future comparable social movement organizations. Based on the results shown above, movements that share the same ideas, beliefs, goals, values, methods, actions, and initiatives as the HM would have a substantial impact on global governance and the social order.

## REFERENCES

- [1]W. Khan, H.U. Khan, “The Gulen Movement: The Blending of Religion and Rationality”. *Journal of Research in Social Sciences*, Jan 2018.
- [2]S.T. Fitzgerald, “Conceptualizing and understanding the Gülen movement”. *Sociology Compass*. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1111/soc4.12461>, 2017.
- [3]H. Taş. (2018). A history of Turkey’s AKP-Gülen conflict. *Mediterranean Politics*. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1080/13629395.2017.1328766>
- [4]A. Aydintasbas, The Good, the Bad, and the Gülenists: the Role of the Gülen Movement in Turkey’s Coup Attempt. *European Council on Foreign Relations*, 2016.
- [5]R.O. Freedman, Turkey’s Tarnish. *Baltimore Jewish Times*, 2010.
- [6]S. Dreher. What is the Hizmet Movement? Contending Approaches to the Analysis of Religious Activists In World Politics. *Sociology of Islam*, 2014. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1163/22131418-00104008>
- [7]B. Arslan, “Pious science: The Gulen community and the making of a conservative modernity in Turkey”, 2010.
- [8]I.B. Gözaydin The Fethullah Gülen movement and politics in Turkey: A chance for democratization or a Trojan horse? *Democratization*, 2009. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1080/13510340903271837>
- [9]S. Robinson. “Islam, Responsibility and Business in the Thought of Fethullah Gülen”. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 2015. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10551-014-2101-3>.
- [10]S.T. Fitzgerald, “Conceptualizing and understanding the Gülen movement”. *Sociology Compass*. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1111/soc4.12461>, 2017.
- [11]B. Balci, “Situating the Gülen movement in France and in Europe”. *Politics, Religion, and Ideology*, 2018. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1080/21567689.2018.1453262>
- [12]A.T Ayaz, The Role of International Non-governmental Organizations (NGO) in preserving international peace and security. *International Academic Journal of Social Sciences*, 2019. Available: <https://doi.org/10.9756/iajss/v6i1/1910006>
- [13]M.O. Webb, Hizmet, religious knowledge, and scientific education. *Revista Brasileira de Ciencias Sociais*, 2016. Available: <https://doi.org/10.17666/31909-16/2016>.

- [14]H, Aydin, Four Stakeholder's perception on educational effectiveness of Nigerian Turkish international colleges: A qualitative case study. *SAGE Open*, (2013). Available: <https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244013489693>
- [15]H.A, Bashir, Nigeria-Turkey Relations: An Overview. *European Scientific Journal ESJ*, 14(35), 247–257, 2018. Available: <https://doi.org/10.19044/esj.2018.v14n35p2-47>
- [16]S.P, Watmough, & A.E, Öztürk, The Future of the Gülen Movement in Transnational Political Exile: Introduction to the Special Issue. *Politics, Religion & Ideology*, 2018b.
- [17]A, McConnell, A public policy approach to understanding the nature and causes of foreign policy failure. *Journal of European Public Policy*. 2016. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1080/13501763.2015.1127278>
- [18]R, Bayer, & E.F, Keyman, E. F. Turkey: An Emerging Hub of Globalization and Internationalist Humanitarian Actor? *Globalizations*, 2012. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1080/14747731.2012.627721>
- [19]NewsRescue.com. "Buhari Orders T129 Attack Copters, Expected In 3 Months". Retrieved from <http://newsrescue.com/boko-haram-buhari-orders-t129-attackcopters-expected-in-3-months-unconfirmed/>, 2015.
- [20]A, Murinson, A. The strategic depth doctrine of Turkish foreign policy. *Middle Eastern Studies*, 2016. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1080/00263200600923526>
- [21]A, Gabrielle. "The Gülen Movement and the Transfer of a Political Conflict from Turkey to Senegal" *Politics, Religion & Ideology*, 2018. 19:1, 53-68, DOI:10.1080/21567689.2018.1453256
- [22]H, Aydin, Four Stakeholder's perception on educational effectiveness of Nigerian Turkish international colleges: A qualitative case study. *SAGE Open*, (2013). Available: <https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244013489693>.
- [23]Nigerian Turkish International Colleges, "About NTIC". Retrieved from <http://prospective.ntic.edu.ng/>, 2020.
- [24]Nile University of Nigeria, "About NILE – History of NILE", Nile University, Retrieved from <https://www.nileuniversity.edu.ng/history-of-nile-university>, 2020
- [25]R, Woodhall. "Organizing the organization, educating the educators: An examination of Fethullah Gülen's teaching and the membership of the movement". A Paper presented at the Islam in the Contemporary World: *The Fethullah Gülen Movement in Thought and Practice*. Houston, TX: Rice University, 2018.
- [26]M. Khan, "Turkish GDP rebounds strongly at 3.5%", *Financial Times*, 2017. Available: [www.ft.com](http://www.ft.com)
- [27]BBC. "The Mint countries: Next economic giants"? *BBC News Magazine*, 2014.
- [28]A, Murinson, A. The strategic depth doctrine of Turkish foreign policy. *Middle Eastern Studies*, 2016. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1080/00263200600923526>.
- [29]K.E Uchegara, "Continuity and change in Turkish foreign policy toward Africa". *Gazi Academic View*, 2(3), 2018.
- [30]BBC News. "Turkey's post-coup crackdown hits 'Gülen schools' worldwide", 2016.
- [31]R.O, Keohane, & J.S, Nye, Realism and Complex Interdependence. In *International Political Economy*, 1996. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-349-24443-05>
- [32]W, Rana. "Theory of Complex Interdependence: A Comparative Analysis of Realist and Neoliberal Thoughts". *International Journal of Business and Social Science*, 2015.